IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA STATESVILLE DIVISION

RAMONA WINEBARGER and REX WINEBARGER, CASE NOS. 5:15CV57-RLV; Plaintiffs,

3:15CV211-RLV

v. BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORPORATION, Defendant	
MARTHA CARLSON, Plaintiff,	
v.	

BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORPORATION Defendants

PLAINTIFFS OBJECTIONS AND COUNTER DESIGNATIONS TO DEFENDANT BOSTON SCIENTIFIC'S DEPOSITION DESIGNATIONS OF FRANK ZAKRZEWSKI **TAKEN ON MARCH 7, 2014**

BSC Designations	Objection	Plaintiffs Counter Designation
fz030714revised, (Page 44:3 to 44:11)		[Counter Designations to BSC
44		44:3-44:11]
3 Q. I'm going to hand you what		,
4 we've marked as Deposition Exhibit 3. And		fz030714revised, (Page 42:5 to
5 for the record, Deposition Exhibit 3 is a		42:9)
6 material safety data sheet for Marlex		42
7 polypropylenes, all grades, dated		5 Q. At any time during
8 January 28th, 2004.		your career,
9 Do you see that down at the		6 were you personally
10 bottom of the first page?		involved in the creation
11 A. I do.		7 of a material safety data
		sheet for
		8 polypropylene?
		9 A. No.
		fz030714revised, (Pages 42:10
		to 43:4)
		42
		10 Q. And at any time
		during your

	11 career, have you ever
	been involved in
	12 conversations with Boston
	Scientific
	13 regarding the
	9 9
	procurement of polypropylene
	14 from Philips Sumika?
	15 A. I actually don't
	recall.
	16 Q. Sitting here
	today, you have no
	7 7
	17 memory of any
	interactions with Boston
	18 Scientific on
	polypropylene resin
	19 specifically?
	20 A. I don't I
	actually don't
	l ·
	21 have memory of it, no, I
	don't.
	22 Q. Okay. And can
	you just tell me
	23 what your job duties are
	as the procurement
	24 operation manager?
	43
	I A. Basically, I'm
	responsible for
	2 the plant operations side
	of procurement, so
	3 I'm not I'm responsible
	for what the
	4 plants buy themselves
fz030714revised, (Page 45:3 to 45:12)	[Counter Designations to 45:3-
45	45:12]
3 Q. And in the deposition notice	fz030714revised, (Page 45:22
4 from Boston Scientific, we specifically asked	to 45:23)
5 about the medical application caution	45
6 language that's on the first page of the	22 Q. Do you know who
7 MSDS, and do you understand the medical	wrote the MSDS?
8 application caution language to be what's	23 A. I do not.
9 contained in those three paragraphs under	
what I've just highlighted?	fz030714revised, (Page 137:12
11 A. Yes, I can read read that	to 137:16)
	137.16)
12 it's on here, yes.	
	12 Q. Are you aware at all,
	sir, of
	13 the any regulations
	related to the
	14 contents of an MSDS
	sheet?
	Direct.

	1	1
		15 MR. MARRS:
		Objection, form.
		16 A. I'm not.
		fz030714revised, (Pages
		137:18 to 138:1)
		137
		18 Q. Are you aware at all
		of whether
		19 the appropriate
		applications for use of a
		20 particular material
		product are supposed to
		21 be included in Section 1?
		22 MR. MARRS:
		Objection, form.
		23 MR. STRONGMAN: Form.
		24 A. No. We do not
		determine
		138
		1 suitability of use.
fz030714revised, (Pages 45:24 to 46:11)	45:24-46:11	fz030714revised, (Pages
45	FRE 401,	134:10 to 135:6)
24 Q. Was the medical application	402, 403,	134.10 to 133.0)
46	602,	10 Q. You, I think based on
1 statement that we've highlighted in	Speculative,	the
2 Deposition Exhibit 3 added to the	Foundation	11 answer you just gave, are
3 polypropylene MSDS based on any scientific		not involved in the
4 testing that was conducted?		12 actual scientific testing,
5 A. Not that I'm aware of, no.		the technical side
6 Q. And was the medical application		13 of Phillips Sumika?
7 statement for polypropylene in the MSDS		14 A. Correct.
8 marked as Deposition Exhibit 3 added based on		15 Q. So the actual
9 any specific scientific data on		testing of
10 polypropylene?		16 Phillips Sumika of Marlex
11 A. No. Not that I'm aware of.		is not something
		17 with which you're
		involved?
		18 MS. COHEN:
		Objection.
		19 MR.
		STRONGMAN: Form.
		20 A. Hands-on
		involvement, no.
		21 BY MR. PERDUE:
		22 Q. As you sit here
		today, you are
		23 not aware of testing that
		Phillips Sumika did

		24 regarding the safety or lack of safety to use 135 1 Marlex in polypropylene mesh for implantation 2 in the human body? 3 MR. MERRELL: Objection, form. 4 MR. STRONGMAN: Form. 5 A. We did no testing of any Marlex 6 for medical applications.
fz030714revised, (Page 47:8 to 47:21) 47	47:8 – 47:21 FRE 401,	
8 Q. Was the medical application	402, 403,	
9 statement that we're looking at in Deposition	602,	
10 Exhibit 3 added to the polypropylene MSDS	Speculative,	
11 based on any review of the scientific or	Foundation	
12 medical literature on polypropylene?13 A. Yeah, I'm not aware of any		
14 testing or information on polypropylene		
15 related to this statement.		
16 Q. And was the medical application		
17 statement for the polypropylene material		
18 safety data sheet added to the MSDS based on		
19 any scientific concerns with vaginal mesh20 specifically?		
21 A. No.		
fz030714revised, (Pages 64:4 to 65:1)		
64		
4 Q. I'm going to hand you what's		
5 been marked as Deposition Exhibit 7, and		
6 Deposition Exhibit 7 is Bates numbered CP-70, 7 running to 79, and it's a Marlex HGX-030-01		
8 polypropylene MSDS.		
9 Mr. Zakrzewski, have you seen		
10 Deposition Exhibit 7 in your preparation for		
11 your deposition today?		
12 A. Yes, I believe I have.		
13 Q. And with regard to Deposition		
14 Exhibit 7, this MSDS for HGX-030-01 has what		
15 revision date?		
16 A. 10/17/2011.		
17 Q. And the HGX-030-01 MSDS marked		
18 as Deposition Exhibit 7 likewise has a		
19 medical application statement in Section 1;		
20 is that correct? 21 A. It does.		
1 4. It does.		l i

 statement in Deposition Exhibit 7 placed on the MSDS based on any scientific testing that 	FRE 401, 402, 403,
65	602,
1 was done on polypropylene?	Foundation,
	Speculative.
fz030714revised, (Pages 65:3 to 66:11)	
65	65:3-4
3 A. I know of no scientific testing	FRE 401,
4 related to this.5 BY MR. STRONGMAN:	402, 403, 602,
6 Q. And if you could look with me	Foundation,
7 at the very last page, Bates numbered	Speculative
8 CP-00078, on Deposition Exhibit 7, are you	1
9 with me?	
10 A. Page 78, yes.	
Q. And there's a legacy MSDSnumber included for Deposition Exhibit 7 on	
13 that page. Do you see it?	
14 A. Yes.	
15 Q. And what is the legacy MSDS	
16 number that's provided?	
17 A. 240590.	
18 Q. And is that the same MSDS 19 number for the MSDSs that we were just	
20 looking at?	
21 A. Yes.	
Q. And on the same page under that	
23 same section of Deposition Exhibit 7, there	
24 is an NFPA classification, do you see that?	
66 1 A. I'm sorry, NFPA? Yes.	
1 A. I'm sorry, NFPA? Yes. 2 Q. And there's a health hazard	
3 category. Do you see that?	
4 A. Yes.	
5 Q. And what is the number given	
6 for health hazard?	
7 A. Zero. 8 Q. Mr. Zakrzewski, are you aware	
9 of Phillips adding a medical application	
statement to any MSDS for polypropylene as a	
11 result of scientific testing that was done?	
	66:8-66:13
	FRE 401, 402, 403,
	602,
	Foundation,
	Speculative
fz030714revised, (Page 66:13 to 66:13)	66:13
66	

10 4 1	EDE 401	T
13 A. I am not.	FRE 401,	
	402, 403,	
	602,	
	Foundation,	
	Speculative	
fz030714revised, (Pages 69:18 to 71:8)		fz030714revised, (Page 74:6 to
69		74:9)
18 Q. Mr. Zakrzewski, have you had an		74
19 opportunity to review Deposition Exhibit 8?		6 Q. Based on Deposition
20 A. Yes.		Exhibit 8,
Q. And for the record, Deposition		7 PSPC agreed that it would
22 Exhibit 8 is an agreement between PSPC and		sell polypropylene
23 Boston Scientific; is that correct?		8 to Boston Scientific after
24 A. Yes.		January 28th of
70		9 2004; is that fair?
1 Q. And what was the effective date		fz030714revised, (Pages 74:18
2 of the agreement marked as Deposition		to 75:8)
3 Exhibit 8?		74
		, ,
4 A. October 1, 2004. 5 Q. So the effective date of the		18 A. You're asking if they could
6 agreement between PSPC and Boston Scientific		19 if we would agree to sell
7 was after January of 2004, correct?		polypropylene to
8 A. October comes after January,		20 them, not the application?
9 correct.		Yes.
Q. And looking down at the second		21 BY MR. STRONGMAN:
11 paragraph of Exhibit 8, the agreement states		22 Q. So yes, PSPC
12 that Boston Scientific may from time to time		based on
13 order certain PSPC polypropylene product		23 Exhibit 8
14 listed in Attachment A. Do you see that?		24 A. We don't know
15 A. Yes, I see that.		your application.
16 Q. And did you look at		75
17 Attachment A to Deposition Exhibit 8?		1 Q. And is it the
18 A. Yes, I did.		responsibility of
19 Q. And Attachment A lists		2 the entity that purchases
20 HGX-030-01; is that correct?		the resin from
21 A. Yes.		3 Phillips to make sure that
Q. And that's a polypropylene		the application is
23 grade?		4 appropriate?
24 A. Yes.		5 A. Yeah, this is
71		standard language
1 Q. And based on the terms of the		6 on contracts that we do
2 agreement that's marked as Deposition		not determine
3 Exhibit 8, it states that the polypropylene		7 suitability of use. We don't
4 may be used by, for or on behalf of Boston		know your
5 Scientific in the manufacture of medical		8 market or your
6 devices which may be implanted in the human		application.
7 body or have contact with internal body		
8 fluids or tissues; is that correct?		
fz030714revised, (Page 71:13 to 71:14)		
71		
13 A. The agreement gives them the		

14 right to buy resin.		
fz030714revised, (Page 78:10 to 78:13) 78 10 Q. And you're not here today to 11 offer any criticisms about any conduct of 12 Boston Scientific; is that true? 13 A. That's true. fz030714revised, (Page 107:8 to 107:10) 107 8 Q. Phillips Sumika did not 9 consider Marlex 030 to be marketed and sold 10 for the intended use of medical devices?	78:10-78:13 FRE 401, 402, 403	[Counter Designation to BSC 107:8-20] fz030714revised, (Page 86:15 to 86:17) 86 15 Q. Let me hand you what I've 16 marked as Exhibit 10. 17 A. Okay. fz030714revised, (Page 87:3 to 87:20) 87 3 Q. If you look to this is 4 Bates-labeled BSCM06700722580, continuing 5 through. Look specifically if you would, 6 sir, to the e-mail of August 2nd, 2011, in 7 this string. Do you see the cc there? It's 8 the second page of Exhibit 10. 9 A. Yes. 10 Q. The cc the from is from Bob 11 Rhoades, correct? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. And it is an e-mail that is at 14 a cpchem.com e-mail address, correct? 15 A. Yes.
		2nd, 2011, in 7 this string. Do you see the cc there? It's 8 the second page of Exhibit 10.
		10 Q. The cc the from is from Bob 11 Rhoades, correct? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 Q. And it is an e-mail that is at 14 a cpchem.com e-mail
		*
		STRONGMAN: Form. 20 A. Yes.

fz030714revised, (Page 90:4 to 90:11) 90 4 Q. The first e-mail in this chain5 is from a Mr. McCaslin dated July the 29th, 6 2011. Do you see that? It's page 7 of the 7 exhibit. 8 A. Yes. Q. And the subject matter is 10 "Phillips Chevron," correct? 11 A. Correct. fz030714revised, (Page 90:12 to 90:22) 90 12 Q. Do you have any recollection, 13 sir, about history of purchases by Boston 14 Scientific from Phillips Sumika before 2011? 15 STRONGMAN: Form. A. Direct? Direct purchases? 17 BY MR. PERDUE: Q. Yes, sir. 18 19 MR. STRONGMAN: Same objection. 20 A. No, we did not sell -- based on 21 the records I checked, we never sold Boston 22 Scientific directly. fz030714revised, (Pages 92:23 to 93:4) 92 23 Q. If you go forward in the 24 document, and that is in the e-mail chain, 1 you'll see an e-mail, sir, from Rick Williams

2 from a CPChem e-mail address. Do you see 3 that on page 6? A. Yes. fz030714revised, (Pages 94:8 to 95:15) 94 8 Q. Mr. Williams writes on behalf 9 of Chevron Phillips, "I have brought the 10 below referenced issue to the attention of 11 Bob Rhoades, Phillips Sumika General Manager. 12 Bob has agreed to discuss the issue further 13 with this Mr. Todd McCaslin, should he wish 14 to contact Bob." 15 Do you see that, sir? 16 Yes, I do. A. 17 Q. At this time in August 2011, 18 was Mr. Rhoades the Phillips Sumika general 19 manager? 20 A. Yes, he was. 21 Q. If you will go forward then, 22 sir, in the e-mail chain to page 4, what is 23 the date of this e-mail? 24 A. August 2nd, 2011. 95 Q. And according to this document, 2 who is it from? 3 A. It's from Bob Rhoades. Who is it to? 4 Q. 5 A. It's to Todd McCaslin. And who is the --Q. who is copied 7 on the e-mail, included in the e-mail chain?

A. Frank Zakrzewski, myself. Q. And the subject matter is what, 10 sir? A. PSPC HGX-030 11 -- oh, 03-01. 12 Q. That is a polypropylene resin? A. Well, that's not, 13 but --14 There should be Q. another zero? 15 A. Should be another zero. fz030714revised, (Page 96:11 to 96:17) 96 11 Q. And what does Mr. Rhoades' 12 e-mail say here on August 2nd, 2011? 13 A. It says, "PSPC is not 14 interested in amending our 2004 agreement 15 concerning sales of HGX-03-01. The decision 16 was made and agreed upon back in 2004, and 17 our position has not changed." fz030714revised, (Pages 97:5 to 99:13) 5 Q. The next e-mail in the chain 6 is, again, from Mr. Todd McCaslin at a BSCI, 7 or Boston Scientific, email address there on 8 page 3. Do you see that, sir? 9 A. Yes. 10 Q. This is dated August 2nd, 2011, 11 the same date, correct? 12 A. Yes.

13 Q. It is addressed to
Bob Rhoades
14 who was the GM for
CPChem and
15 A. Phillips Sumika.
16 Q Phillips
Sumika?
17 A. Yes.
~ · ·
copied on this
19 e-mail, correct?
20 A. Correct.
21 Q. It has the same
subject line,
22 correct?
23 A. Correct.
24 Q. And in this, Mr.
McCaslin, who
98
1 works for Boston
Scientific, says, "Bob, I
2 appreciate the quick
response. Unfortunately
3 back in 2004 we were not
aware how good the
4 Phillips material was and
how difficult
5 finding a replacement
would be. Would you be
6 willing to discuss this
further, as I would
7 like to understand if there
is anything
8 Boston Scientific could
offer/provide that
9 would change this
decision?
10 "If it's a liability
issue, I
11 believe we can work with
our legal to draft
12 appropriate language that
fully protects
13 PSPC. If it is financial, I
realize our
14 requirements are very
small, we could discuss
be would be
16 attractive to PSPC. Let
me know if you would

17 be willing to discuss further. Thank you, 18 Todd, Todd McCaslin, **Global Sourcing** 19 Director, Boston Scientific Corporation." 20 As you sit here today, sir, do 21 you have any recollection of receiving this 22 e-mail? 23 MR. STRONGMAN: Form, foundation. A. No. 2 BY MR. PERDUE: 3 Q. Do you have any reason to 4 dispute that you were cc'd on this e-mail 5 chain? 6 MR. STRONGMAN: Form. A. I do not. 8 BY MR. PERDUE: 9 Q. If we then go forward to 10 Mr. Rhoades' reply, which is also dated 11 August 2nd, 2011, at a later time, 6:05 p.m. Do you see that, 12 sir? Page 2. 13 A. Page 2. 6:05, yes, I see that. fz030714revised, (Pages 100:10 to 102:22) 100 10 Q. Mr. Rhoades writes to, 11 according to the e-mail, Mr. McCaslin later 12 on the evening of August 2nd, 2011. Do you 13 see that? 14 A. Yes, sir. 15 Q. Mr. Rhoades writes, "Thanks,

16 Todd. We're simply not interested in this 17 business at any price, which is still the 18 basis of our past agreement with your 19 company." 20 Do you see that, sir? 21 MR. STRONGMAN: Form. 22 A. Yes. 23 BY MR. PERDUE: 24 Q. Do you have a recollection of 1 Mr. Rhoades responding to Mr. McCaslin's 2 repeated requests for purchases of 3 Marlex 030-01 in 2011 with a final response 4 that Phillips Sumika was simply not 5 interested in any price of further sales to 6 their company? 7 MR. STRONGMAN: Form, 8 foundation. A. I mean, I'm starting --10 actually, I'm starting to remember a little 11 of this, but I don't have a lot of 12 recollection on the emails. 13 I do remember them coming back 14 now and asking for resin, and normal course 15 of business would have been Bob as a GM would 16 have spoken with the sales manager. 17 BY MR. PERDUE: 18 Q. The course of this would be 19 normal? 20 A. Yes.

	21 Q. And the ultimate
	decision on
	22 behalf of Phillips Sumika
	would be Bob's,
	23 Mr. Rhoades'?
	24 A. The decision
	would be Bob's.
	102
	1 Q. You have testified
	that Boston
	2 Scientific pardon me,
	that Phillips Sumika
	3 never sold Boston
	Scientific resin for the
	4 express purpose of
	implantation through a
	5 medical device for
	permanent use in the human
	6 body?
	7 MR.
	STRONGMAN: Form,
	8 foundation.
	9 A. Actually, we
	never we don't
	10 have any records of
	making any sale.
	11 Normally we set up a
	customer, ship to, bill
	12 to, a name. In SAP we
	don't have any records
	13 of ever selling Boston
	Scientific resin
	14 directly.
	15 BY MR. PERDUE:
	16 Q. As you sit here
	today, do you
	17 know then how Boston
	Scientific ever got any
	18 resin that it would
	characterize as
	19 Marlex 030-01?
	20 MR.
	STRONGMAN: Form.
	21 A. Yeah, that would
	be just
	22 speculation on how they
	got it
fz030714revised, (Page 107:15 to 107:20) 107	
15 A. We don't determine suitability	
15 11. We don't determine suitubility	

16 of use. Our expertise is in producing resin, 17 and there are steps between resin and a final 18 product. We don't we're not experts in 19 processing. We're not experts in determining 20 how someone wants to use our product. 168 168 169 100 119 119 110 110 110 110 110 110 11	16 -f O		
18 product. We don't we're not experts in determining 20 how someone wants to use our product.			
19 processing. We're not experts in determining 20 how someone wants to use our product 168:20-24 168:20 to 168:24) 168 20 Q. Did Phillips Sumika expect the 21 end processors to make the determination as 22 to the suitability of using Marlex resin for 3 whichever application they chose? 24 A. Yes. 26 27 28 28 29 29 29 29 29 29			
20 how someone wants to use our product. 16030714revised, (Page 168:20 to 168:24) 168 20 Q. Did Phillips Sumika expect the 21 end processors to make the determination as 22 to the suitability of using Marlex resin for 23 whichever application they chose? 4 A. Yes.	18 product. We don't we're not experts in		
168-20-24 fc30714revised, (Page 168:20 to 168:24) 168-20-24 fc30714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 179 1 antioxidant? 2	19 processing. We're not experts in determining		
168-20-24 fc30714revised, (Page 168:20 to 168:24) 168-20-24 fc30714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 179 1 antioxidant? 2			
168 20 Q. Did Phillips Sumika expect the 21 end processors to make the determination as 22 to the suitability of using Marlex resin for 23 whichever application they chose?	*	168-20-24	fz030714revised (Pages
20 Q. Did Phillips Sumika expect the 21 end processors to make the determination as 22 to the suitability of using Marlex resin for 23 whichever application they chose? 24 A. Yes. Speculative 18 CP-00010 in Exhibit 18. That would be one of 19 these data sheet; page 10. This is a Marlex 20 HGX-030-01 Phillips Sumika data sheet; is 21 that correct? 22 A. Yes. 23 Q. And the suggested applications 24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what? fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what			
21			
22			
23 whichever application they chose? 18 \$CP-00010 in Exhibit 18. That would be one of 19 these data sheets, page 10. This is a Marlex 20 HGX-030-01 Phillips Sumika data sheet; is 21 that correct? 22 A. Yes. 23 Q. And the suggested applications 24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what? 193 1 what? 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." f2030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 1 f2030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 1 f2030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) f	21 end processors to make the determination as	Foundation,	17 Q. Let's start with you
23 whichever application they chose?	22 to the suitability of using Marlex resin for	Speculative	looking at
That would be one of 19 these data sheets, page 10. This is a Marlex 20 HGX-030-01 Phillips Sumika data sheet; is 21 that correct? 22 A. Yes. 23 Q. And the suggested applications 24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what? fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178 178 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 128 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips - 2 A. Yes. 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika this 3 4 through 94. Can you 1 1 through 94. Can you 1 1 through 94. Can you 1 1 through 94. Can you	23 whichever application they chose?	_	18 CP-00010 in Exhibit 18.
19 these data sheets, page 10. This is a Marlex 20 HGX-030-01 Phillips Sumika data sheet; is 21 that correct? 22 A. Yes. 23 Q. And the suggested applications 24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what? fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 178 179 1 antioxidant? 179 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips - 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips - 2 A. Yes. 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 4 through 94. Can you identify what this 1 dentify what this 1 denti	11		
10. This is a Marlex 20	21 11. 105.		· ·
20 HGX-030-01 Phillips Sumika data sheet; is 21 that correct? 22			
Sumika data sheet; is 21 that correct?			
21 that correct? 22			_
22			Sumika data sheet; is
23 Q. And the suggested applications 24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what? fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 128 1 a production from CP, or 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 1 a production from CP, or 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			21 that correct?
23 Q. And the suggested applications 24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what? fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 128 1 a production from CP, or 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 1 a production from CP, or 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
Suggested applications			I I
24 for Marlex HGX-030-01 by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what?			~
by Phillips Sumika are 193 1 what?			
1 what?			-
1 what? fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 178 127:24 to 128:11) 127 179 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 22 A. Yes. 128 12 particular (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 127 128 127 128 127 128 127 128 127 128 127 128 127 128 127 128			by Phillips Sumika are
fz030714revised, (Pages 193:23 to 194:2) 193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 127:24 to 128:11) 127 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 128 129 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 128 129			193
193:23 to 194:2) 193 23			1 what?
193:23 to 194:2) 193 23			
193:23 to 194:2) 193 23			fz030714rovised (Pages
193 23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 178 127:24 to 128:11) 178 127 179 124 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 128			
23 A. The data sheet reads, "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what			
"Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what "Woven 24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 2akrzewski, is 128 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
24 industrial fabric and bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 2 I backing, woven bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven carpet 18			
bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what bags, woven carpet 194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 2akrzewski, is 128 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			"Woven
194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what			24 industrial fabric and
194 1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what			· ·
1 backing, woven bags, woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage."			
woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what woven geotextile 2 fabrics," and "rope and cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 128:11) fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) fz030714revised, (Pages 127			I I
fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) 178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 12 fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 25 A. Yes. 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			o o
cordage." fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 127:24 to 128:11) 127 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 128 1 a production from CP, or 4 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 128 1 a production from CP, or 5 A. Yes. 2 A. Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			_
fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10) fz030714revised, (Pages 127:24 to 128:11) 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 127 179 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 1 antioxidant? Zakrzewski, is 2 A. Yes. 128 3 Q. You know that it is an 1 a production from CP, or 4 antioxidant? Chevron Phillips 5 A. Yes. 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 3 Q Phillips 7 the purpose of that additive? Sumika, dash, 00091 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 4 through 94. Can you 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what identify what this			-
178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 127:24 to 128:11) 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
178 24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 127:24 to 128:11) 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this	fz030714revised, (Pages 178:24 to 180:10)		fz030714revised, (Pages
24 Q. Do you know if it's an 179 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 23 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 127 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. 22 Akrzewski, is 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this	_		
179 1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 24 Q. Exhibit 14, Mr. Zakrzewski, is 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this	24 O. Do you know if it's an		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
1 antioxidant? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what Zakrzewski, is 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
2 A. Yes. 3 Q. You know that it is an 4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 1 a production from CP, or Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
3Q. You know that it is an1 a production from CP, or4 antioxidant?Chevron Phillips5A. Yes.2 A. Phillips Sumika?6Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know3 Q Phillips7the purpose of that additive?Sumika, dash, 000918A. It's also an antioxidant.4 through 94. Can you9Q. And DHT-4A, do you know whatidentify what this			I
4 antioxidant? 5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what Chevron Phillips 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
5 A. Yes. 6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 2 A. Phillips Sumika? 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this	4 antioxidant?		
6 Q. And Irgafos 168, do you know 7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 3 Q Phillips Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this	5 A. Yes.		2 A. Phillips Sumika?
7 the purpose of that additive? 8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what Sumika, dash, 00091 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			
8 A. It's also an antioxidant. 9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what 4 through 94. Can you identify what this			~ I
9 Q. And DHT-4A, do you know what identify what this			
1 10 that is?			
To that is.	10 that is?		5 document is?

11 Not sure. Α. Well, a TSM A. 12 Q. And were these additives added would have been a 13 to the Marlex resin, the HGX-030-01, in 7 technical service May -- starting May 31, 2002? 14 memorandum. 15 MR. MATTHEWS: Object to form. 8 And tell us what 0. 16 According to this sheet, and a technical 17 I'm going by this manufacturing spec, it 9 service memorandum is. 18 looks like this change was made in -- started 10 Α. Just reporting of 19 running these additives 9/11 of '97, based on some general 20 what I'm reading. 11 information. 21 BY MR. MERRELL: 22 And these three additives here, fz030714revised, (Pages O. 23 those are added by Phillips Sumika to the 199:20 to 200:17) 24 resin? 199 180 20 On this technical service Yes. 1 A. 21 memorandum, I think you 2 Q. Do you know if there were any -- this is something 3 changes at all to the additives after May 31, 22 that was, once again, 4 2002? prepared by Phillips 5 23 Sumika, right? A. Do I know if they were? 6 That there were any changes to 24 Q. A. Yes. 7 the --200 8 Q. No changes. 1 All right. And A. 9 No changes? Q. you can see 10 A. I confirmed that. 2 where I've highlighted there it says, 3 "Table 2 lists several strong mineral acids, 4 halogens and oxygen which can chemically 5 attack Marlex polypropylene causing 6 degradation of the resin." 7 Did I read that correctly? 8 A. Yes. 9 That is something 0. that Phillips 10 Sumika was aware of and published with regard 11 to its Marlex polypropylene, correct? 12 MR. MARRS: Objection, form. 13 Whoever did this A. document, 14 yes --15 BY MR. MATTHEWS: 16 Q. Right. 17 -- stated that

fz030714revised, (Pages 201:14 to 202:9) 201 14 Q. Look on the next page, page 92. 15 Down at the bottom, where it says "Table 2." 16 On page 92 of Exhibit 14, it states that, 17 "Marlex polypropylene has good chemical 18 resistance to most mineral acids and bases, 19 but like other polyolefins can be attacked by 20 some strong mineral acids, halogens and 21 oxygens. The effect of strong oxidizing 22 agents is an attack on the polymer chain 23 resulting in eventual embrittlement of the 24 resin." 202 Again, based upon this document 2 produced in response to our request, that *3* information that I just read is something 4 that was known to Phillips Sumika with regard 5 to its Marlex polypropylene; is that correct? MS. COHEN: 6 Foundation. 7 MR. STRONGMAN: Objection, form. 8 9 A. They printed it, yes. fz030714revised, (Page 203:3 to 203:5) 203 3 Q. I'll show you Exhibit 3, which 4 is the 2004 MSDS. 5 A. Okay.

	1	,
		fz030714revised, (Pages
		204:13 to 205:8)
		204
		13 Q. Look on page 5. I
		think it's
		14 page 5 of Exhibit 3. Let
		me find mine. One
		15 second. Sorry, page 6.
		16 You see the
		statement that I've
		17 highlighted under Section
		10?
		18 A. "Incompatibility
		with other
		19 materials may react with
		oxygen and strong
		20 oxidizing agents such as
		chlorates, nitrates,
		21 peroxides, et cetera."
		22 Q. And when
		Phillips Sumika makes
		23 a statement like this in its
		material safety
		24 data sheet, is that
		statement accurate?
		205
		1 A. Yes.
		$oldsymbol{arepsilon}$
		that Phillips
		3 Sumika would have
		personal knowledge of or it
		4 would not be in this
		material safety data
		5 sheet?
		6 MR. MERRELL:
		Objection, form.
		7 A. It's a I view it
		as a
		8 warning. It should be
		taken seriously.
fz030714revised, (Page 183:9 to 183:11)	183:9-14	Ĭ
183	FRE 401,	
9 Q. To be clear, though, as you	402, 403,	
10 said before, you've seen no testing that led	602,	
11 to that change in the MSDS; is that correct?	Foundation,	
11 to that change in the Mobb, is that correct:	Speculative	
fz030714revised, (Page 183:13 to 183:14)	183:13-14	
<u> </u>		
183	FRE 401,	
13 A. There's no testing that I'm	402, 403,	
14 aware of	602,	

	Foundation,
	Speculative
fz030714revised, (Page 184:11 to 184:14)	184:11-14
184	FRE 401,
11 You're not aware of any	402, 403,
12 scientific basis for the medical caution	602,
13 statement in the MSDS?	Foundation,
14 A. I'm not.	Speculative

1. Counter Exhibits

- a. Zakrzewski Exhibit 10
- b. Zakrzewski Exhibit 14
- c. Zakrzewski Exhibit 18

DATED: June 26, 2015

Respectfully Submitted,

TRACEY & FOX LAW FIRM

/s/ Sean Tracey
Sean Patrick Tracey
State Bar No. 20176500
Shawn P. Fox
State Bar No. 24040926
Clint Casperson
State Bar No. 24075561
440 Louisiana, Suite 1901
Houston, TX 77002
(800) 925-7216
(866) 709-2333
stracey@traceylawfirm.com
sfox@traceylawfirm.com
ccasperson@traceylawfirm.com

/s/ John R. Fabry

John R. Fabry
Texas Bar No. 06768480
Mark R. Mueller
Texas Bar No. 14623500
MUELLER LAW, PLLC
404 West 7th Street
Austin, TX 78701
(512) 478-1236
(512) 478-1473 (Facsimile)
John.Fabry@muellerlaw.com
Mark@muellerlaw.com
Meshservice@muellerlaw.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on June 26, 2015, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

TRACEY & FOX LAW FIRM

/s/ Sean Tracey
Sean Patrick Tracey
State Bar No. 2176500
Shawn P. Fox
Clint Casperson
State Bar No. 24075561
State Bar No. 24040926
440 Louisiana, Suite 1901
Houston, TX 77002
(800) 925-7216
(866) 709-2333
stracey@traceylawfirm.com
sfox@traceylawfirm.com
ccasperson@traceylawfirm.com

/s/ John R. Fabry
John R. Fabry
Texas Bar No. 06768480
Mark R. Mueller
Texas Bar No. 14623500
MUELLER LAW, PLLC
404 West 7th Street
Austin, TX 78701
(512) 478-1236
(512) 478-1473 (Facsimile)
John.Fabry@muellerlaw.com
Mark@muellerlaw.com
Meshservice@muellerlaw.com